

Effect of E-Governance on Service Delivery in Enugu State Civil Service: A Study of Selected Ministries

Samuel Chukwuma NDEMA

Lecturer; Godfrey Okoye University, Enugu, Nigeria
Alumnus, University of Strathclyde, Glasgow, Scotland, United Kingdom

Abstract:

This study titled “Effect of E-governance on Service Delivery in Enugu State Civil Service: A Study of Selected Ministries” was aimed at ascertaining the extent to which introduction of biometric verifications has improved payroll system and reduced ghost workers syndrome in Enugu State civil service; determining the extent to which adoption of e-payment have enhanced efficient service delivery in Enugu State civil service; and examining the extent to which the use of ICT facilities have influenced administrative processes in Enugu State civil service. Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) by Fred Davies in 1989 theoretically guided the study. Content analysis design was adopted. Findings revealed that Introduction of biometric verifications has significantly improved payroll system in Enugu State civil service; Adoption of e-payment has enhanced efficient service delivery in Enugu State civil service; and Use of ICT facilities has influenced administrative processes in Enugu State civil service. The study recommended that there is need for improvement in the use of biometric verifications for improved payroll system in Enugu State civil service; there is need for government organizations to key into the e-payment system for enhanced service delivery in Enugu State civil service; there is need for improved use of ICT facilities in administrative processes in Enugu State civil service; and there is need for government to promote ICT facilities especially in the rural areas in order to promote citizens access to internet and participation in electronic administration among others.

SECTION ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background to the Study

In recent times, E-governance which has been conceptualized as the application of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) facilities to enhance public service delivery by converting traditional office paper processes into electronic processes has become a course for concern among scholars and public administration practitioners. E-governance in its simple term refers to the application of ICT to improve the delivery of services in the public sector to attain transparency, accountability, timeliness, and efficiency (Azeez, Abidoye, Adesina, Agbele and Venter, 2012). Onuigbo (2015) submitted that the usage of technology has permeated almost all endeavors of life including the civil service, by providing ways of ensuring easy processing and efficient delivery of services.

Electronic administration has no doubt become a tool for managing the activities of the public service at the global level. Its application seems to have aided the swift delivery of services in developed nations of the world. The development of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) in recent times and the implication it portends for enhancing the performance of the public service, i.e., the agencies involved in providing public goods and

services for and/ or on behalf of a government, constitutes one of the major concerns of scholars and administrators alike.

In Nigeria particularly Enugu State public service, revitalizing the public service so as to make it effective, efficient and people-centred through the adoption of new and emerging technologies for speedy delivery of services to the populace has become quite imperative. In this context, Nwachukwu (2015) opined that information and communication technology have been an effective tool that could assist government reinvent itself faster, run cheaply, better and produce newer outcomes. The public service of any country is a major pillar in determining the development and stability of such country. This is because the public service is the engine for the processing of the vastly acquired and expanded government responsibilities of executing public policies and projects and rendering essential services to the people. In Enugu State, various governmental administrations have attempted repositioning the public sector for effective and efficient service delivery through various reforms. In spite of all these efforts, the public service remains inefficient and incapable of delivering its responsibility (Oni, Oni and Gberevbie, 2015).

Although from the traditional practice of administration, ICT have been in use in businesses and other fields, governments across the country are beginning to embrace and deploy information communication technology to the public service due to the fact that they have realized that the application of ICT is a useful tool that can leverage public sector organisations to change from their routine command and control organisations that are inwardly focused on administration to knowledge-based, networked, learning organisations that are externally focused on service delivery (Nwachukwu, 2015).

Oni, Oni and Gberevbie (2015) highlighted that the various areas in which electronic administration could enhance effective service delivery in Enugu State civil service to include; e-services, aimed at improving the delivery of public services, such as providing public documents online (such as birth certificates, driving licenses, vehicle registration etc.), obtaining information, electronic filing systems, e-payments, e-procurement systems, online time sheets and expense account, electronic memo (e-memo), electronic application submission and approval (e.g. annual leave, sick leave, etc), word processing for generating correspondence, person-to-person communication via electronic message systems, teleconferencing services, facsimile transmission, on-line calendar systems, links to corporate files and outside services, decision support systems, the use of ICT for work-related tasks. It also include e-participation by enabling citizens to express their opinions through public discussion in the law drafting processes as well as in various forms of debate conducted at specialized web portal of the Government and a host of other activities via the World Wide Web.

In Enugu State Civil service, ICT facilities have been applied in various aspects of administration such as in application of computers in processing documents, the integrated payroll system, e-payment system such as remita and online applications among others. However, experience from the recent workers verification exercise conducted for all categories of workers in the state shows that the workers' Bank Verification Numbers were used in tracking ghost workers. According to Punch Newspaper (2019) the state government made significant progress as the verification has saved her about N60 million for one month. The state government procured the services of financial institutions with bias in Information Communication Technology (ICT) to deploy Bank Verification Number (BVN) in tracking and prosecuting ghost workers.

The use of ICT in Enugu State public service appears to have been bedeviled by challenges such as lack of infrastructure, inadequate knowledge of ICT operation and poor maintenance culture of the public servants. According to Olaopa (2014), the impediments

inhibiting E-governance in efficient service delivery in Public Service could be linked to inadequate funds allocated to the e-governance projects, disparity between urban and rural dwellers or those with low literacy levels in accessing the internet, potential to erode the labour needs, lack of the necessary infrastructure (electricity power supply, internet connectivity, telecommunications and computer hardware, optical fiber cables). In addition, Abasilim and Edet (2015) added that most of the public service employees' attitude to change was not favourable to E-governance as a result of their low level of computer literacy and inadequate knowledge that disqualified them in the installation, maintenance, designing and the deployment of ICT infrastructure.

1.2 Statement of the Problem

The pivotal role of the public service to the development of Enugu State informs the various reforms aimed at reinvigorating it in order to be able to efficiently and effectively deliver on its responsibility. Over the years however, it appears evident that public service delivery advancement has not kept pace with the quality found in the private sector despite the awareness that effective functioning of the bureaucracy is pivotal to poverty alleviation and economic growth and development (Nwachukwu, 2015). There have been several reforms aimed at addressing the crisis of inefficiency in the delivery of quality services in the public sector (Olaopa, 2008). Despite these reforms, there appears to be no significant and appreciable improvement in the State's public service. The civil service is still responsive in delivering quality service to the citizens of Enugu State.

In spite of all efforts aimed at improving the administrative efficiency of the public service and repositioning it for effective service delivery, Enugu State civil service remains inefficient and incapable of delivering on its responsibility. Just as Oni, Oni and Gberevbie (2015) argued, efforts to attain higher productivity the public sector have remained a wishful thinking as bureaucratic inefficiency continues to constitute a serious concern. It has adversely affected the efficient delivery of public goods and services to the citizens (Darma and Ali, 2014). However, the major motivating concern of this research is the seeming low level of electronic administration practices in Enugu State Civil Service for effective and efficient service delivery. In view of the stated problem above, the following research questions were formulated to guide the study:

1. To what extent has introduction of biometric verifications improved payroll system and reduced ghost worker syndrome in Enugu State civil service?
2. To what extent has adoption of e-payments enhanced service delivery in Enugu State civil service?
3. To what extent has the use of ICT facilities influenced administrative processes in Enugu State civil service?

1.3 Objectives of the Study

The broad objective of this study was to examine the effect of e-governance on service delivery in Enugu State Civil Service with focus on selected ministries. Specifically, the objectives of this study include:

1. To ascertain the extent to which introduction of biometric verifications has improved payroll system and reduced ghost workers syndrome in Enugu State civil service.
2. To determine the extent to which adoption of e-payment have enhanced efficient service delivery in Enugu State civil service.
3. To examine the extent to which the use of ICT facilities have influenced administrative processes in Enugu State civil service.

1.4 Implications of the Study

The significance of this study cannot be overemphasized given the enormous importance electronic administration in effective service delivery in Enugu State civil service. In view of this, this study will be highly significant to the government in making adequate policy efforts in digitalizing the operations of the civil service system. Similarly, this research will be of immense benefit to the public especially the civil servants in understanding the objectives and role of electronic administration in effective service delivery. Consequently, it will expose the need to make integrated efforts towards the digitalization of the civil service system.

Also, this study will be immensely significant in the field of academics since it will serve as a good reference material to future researchers given the dearth of well researched materials on E-governance and efficient service delivery in Enugu State Civil Service. Finally, this study will be highly beneficial to the researcher in understanding the challenges facing digitalization of the state civil service for efficient service delivery.

1.5 Scope of the Study

This study covers e-governance on service delivery in Enugu State Civil Service. It covers ministries of finance and health in Enugu State between 2015 and 2023. It also covers the concept of e-governance, concept of Service Delivery, concept of Civil Service, role of e-governance on Service Delivery in Enugu State Civil Service.

CHAPTER TWO

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

2.1 Conceptual Review

2.1.1 Concept of E-governance

The concept of E-governance has been variously defined by experts and scholars. In its full meaning, E-governance means electronic administration (Ojo, 2014). There are different opinions on E-governance from various scholars. To Estevez and Janowski (2013), E-governance is the application of technology by government organisations to transform its activities and its interactions with the citizen so as to create an impactful society. Implied in the definition above is that E-governance concerns the application of information and communication technology by a number of government agencies in stimulating the frequent participation of citizens in the governing and administrative process of government institutions.

Sunday (2014) similarly opined that E-governance is the use of ICT by departments of government to promote accountability, awareness creation and further guarantee openness in the administration of government. In other words, administrative and managerial processes of an organization are the major concern of E-governance. The basic focus of E-governance is the internal utilization of information and internet technologies in the management of certain resources such as human, material, capital and machines, which are arranged to aid managerial activities in an organization. Nkwe (2012) in his argument asserted that E-governance is a shift from the traditional model of public administration. The shift is in terms of the delivery of government services to the citizens through the use of ICT. In agreement with the forgoing, Ayo (2014) described E-governance as the administration of a nation through the use of Information Communication Technology. By this definition, the adoption of technology enhances the effectiveness, efficiency, accountability and transparency in the exchange of information.

Adopting E-governance facilitates significant reduction in government expenses, while increasing the earned interest and ability to reduce government contracts (Fatile, 2012). When discussing E-governance, it is more than just talking about a government website on the

internet. E-governance has some strategic objectives. The strategic objectives of E-governance are to streamline and upkeep administration amongst government, citizens, businesses and parties. Using information and communication technology would create a connection among these parties and aid the activities and procedures involved. Electronic Administration is also known as support system which motivates good administration. According to Onuigbo (2015) electronic administration refers to the application of internet facilities in the running of the business of Administration such as recruitment, development and enforcement of policies, laws and regulations.

2.1.2 Concept of Civil Service

The civil service is a term used to cover the public servants who are direct employees of the federal and state governments, other than the police, the armed forces personnel, judicial personnel and the teachers. Its usage excludes also employees of statutory corporations and boards (Nwosu, 1977 cited in Onuigbo and Eme, 2015). According to Adebayo (1986) in Onuigbo and Eme (2015), the civil service comprises all servants of the state, other than those holding political appointments, who are employed in a civil capacity and whose remuneration is paid out of money voted by the legislature.

From the foregoing, it can be deduced that the civil service is the administrative structure employed in civil capacity to fulfill government policies and programmes. This can be viewed in terms of structures i.e. ministries, departments, etc. or the human occupants of public offices i.e. permanent secretaries, ministers, and higher administrative staff. Members of the civil service are employed in a civil capacity as distinguished from military, judicial or police capacity. Military officers, judicial officers, police officers and many other technical officers like doctors, engineers, and draughtsmen are, strictly speaking, not civil servants. Civil servants are mainly of two categories: lower clerical staff and higher administrative staff. The higher administrative staff is directly responsible to the political head of department. The lower clerical staff helps the administrative staff and works under its direct supervision and control. The state reaches the citizens through the civil servants who are well trained, skilled and permanent body of professional class of officials, and who have taken government service as a career.

2.1.3 Concept of Service Delivery

The concept of service delivery defies a universal conceptualization as most social science concepts do. Operationally, service as a concept refers to a product or activity that meets the needs of a user or can be applied by a user. Kayode et al (2013) posited that service delivery entails tangible and intangible goods and services as provided by the government in order to improve the well being of the citizenry. By implication, it is the relationship between policy makers, service providers and poor people.

According to them, it encompasses services and their supporting systems that are typically regarded as a state responsibility. These include social services (education and health services), infrastructure (water, sanitation, roads and bridges), and social welfare among others. For instance, service delivery in the context of local government administration involves the provision of public goods and services such as: establishment and maintenance of roads, sidewalks, street lights, and street drainage system, construction of water reservoirs in towns and villages, construction and management of primary schools. Other essential services include the construction and management of primary health care centres for the care of women and the children, registration of immovable property, solid waste collection and disposal, food and livestock markets, slaughterhouses, management of self help projects, registration and maintenance of civil register, and issuing business licenses, among others.

In the words of Jonathan (2013), service delivery has five way tests it must undergo in order to stand the test of time. The first way- test is efficiency test. In this test, service delivery

is measured in terms of whether there is economy in the use of resources made available. Efficiency entails that managers adopt means that are cost effective in application. Next is efficacy test which measures achievement of the objectives of the programme. Service delivery is said to be efficacious when the objectives and purposes by which it was meant are achieved with minimal shortcomings. In the third test, the question that it raises is whether the service providers face the right incentives for alternative sources in times of modifications. This implies, whether the providers can provide another means within the shortest possible time in the event of problems and challenges in the previous services. The money worth test entails whether amounts or service charges are commensurate with the services provided. Then the fifth test that service delivery should pass is performance measurement. This means measuring the quality of services that are provided in terms of its efficacy and conforming to the global benchmarks in service delivery (Abasilim, Gberevbie, and Ifaloye, 2017).

2.2 Conceptual Review

2.2.1 Factors Affecting E-governance in Effective Service Delivery in the Civil Service

Despite the enormous opportunities of ICTs as a means of efficient and effective public service delivery, the situation on the ground in the Civil Service is not quite rosy. They are challenges of leadership and lack of political will; lack of infrastructure; lack of ICTs skills; attitudinal change for adoption; lack of public confidence in ICTs; safeguarding of public document/secret; lack of confidence in online interaction with government; epileptic power supply; problem of digital divide; high cost of ICTs and affordability; resistance of mind set of people; lack of comprehensive national policy on ICTs; Nigeria's low e-readiness; low ICTs literacy and usage; lack of ICTs units and functions; limited, slow or non-existent internet connectivity; inadequate ICTs funding, and; poor institutional administration structure to drive ICTs.

a. Challenges of Leadership and Political Will

Problems of leadership and political willingness are indeed a great variable constraining ICTs initiative and application in the Nigerian civil service vis-a-vis public service delivery. Like other developing nations, political influence, lack of accountability and transparency, problem of corruption, etc, are threats facing the management of e-government in the public sector of Nigeria. This condition of affairs is supported by Adiele (2017), who argued that the notion of E-governance on its own is not suited for developing countries who want to obtain the associated benefits. According to him, political and social changes are required alongside the implementation of e-governance in the developing countries. He adds that failures due to administrative breakdown, corruption, distortions in markets and the absence of democracy should be addressed before e-government can be implemented in developing countries. The willingness of public officials and leaders is therefore, a key factor in every new initiative such as e- government.

According to Olalekan, Jide and Oludare (2017), given its complex process, risks and challenges, public organizations as well as their leaders have resisted e-government initiatives due to ignorance, policy issues and obsolete rules and regulations.

In Nigeria unfortunately, the leaders have not demonstrated enough commitment towards the utilization of ICTs to deliver public service in the country's civil service. The Civil Service is still at the stage of web presence. Even then, most of the websites of government ministries and departments are characterised by static and insufficient information that are rarely updated, few interactive features and non-existent online services. The insignificant interest of the political leaders has greatly reduced the potentials of ICTs enhancing public service delivery in the Civil Service. One can therefore, see that leadership remains the greatest challenge facing the utilization of ICTs in the Federal Civil Service.

b. Problem of Digital Divide

Digital divide refers to the gap or inequalities between people who have the resources and access to ICTs and people who do not have the resources and access to the technology. The term also describes the discrepancy or gap between those who have the skills, knowledge and abilities to use ICTs and those who do not. In Nigeria today, digital divide is experienced between the urban rich and poor; between the rural and urban citizens; and between the ICT literate and the ICT illiterate. This manifests also in the language in which ICT content is delivered which can only be understood by a minority few. Onuigbo and Eme (2015) adduced that many Nigerians are poor and live in rural areas and as such lack access to ICTs. This means that these categories of Nigerians might not obtain important government information and services, or even consider participating in online interactions with the government. Poor and disadvantaged groups, particularly women often face special constraints in accessing ICTs and using them for their specific needs. Unequal access can therefore, worsen existing inequalities. The risks of economic exclusion suggest that the Nigerian government should be concerned with the level of connectivity and ICTs provision and with how to enable access and deploy ICTs and its content in ways that expand relevant information for the poor, increase their voice in decision-making and address bottlenecks to their lives (Azemi, Romle and Udin, 2016).

c. Low ICT Skill, Literacy and Usage

Besides the problems of leadership, digital divide, and the dearth of ICTs infrastructure in the country, e-government initiatives in the civil service lacks personnel with the requisite ICTs skills needed for public service delivery. Regardless of the existence or sophistication of ICTs, human beings remain the most critical success factor. They are the users and creators of data. They are the managers of the technology. According to Azemi, Romle and Udin (2016) opined that this particular problem of lack of qualified staff and inadequate human resources training is pervasive and chronic in many developing countries for many years now. The problem hinges on the unavailability of human capacities that have the technical skills for installation, maintenance, design and implementation of ICTs infrastructure.

Indeed, the problem of low ICTs skill, literacy and usage impacts negatively on Nigeria's E-governance readiness index. Adiele (2017) noted that E-governance readiness is a comparative ranking of the countries of the world by the United Nations Public Administration (UNPA) Network according to two primary indicators; the state of e-government readiness; and the extent of e-participation. The key issues leading to the low e-government readiness in Nigeria are lack of technical ICTs human capacity; low ICTs literacy and usage; lack of ICTs units and functions; little or no access to ICTs infrastructure; and limited, slow and non-existent internet connectivity.

Apart from lack of technical ICTs skills in the public sector, which affects Nigeria's e-readiness, the civil service does not have the requisite in-house managerial ICTs skills. In addition, it lacks the training programmes to create a sustainable pool of staff with basic ICTs literacy, technical and managerial skills. The main consequence of this problem is the tendency to use external consultants and contractors, which makes ICTs application very expensive in the civil service.

One can see from the foregoing that human capital development is a vital prerequisite for e-government application in the federal civil service. This has become even more necessary considering the low qualification of ICTs personnel and professionals in Nigeria.

d. Problem of Adapting to Change

Problem of adapting to change is another key challenge to ICTs application in the Civil Service. Change is one phenomenon that is permanent or constant in nature but always difficult to be followed due to resistance. Resistance to change associated with ICTs application in the civil service comes about due to factors such as culture, labour, ideological issues and inertia

of the options and habits. Among the foregoing factors, culture is the most challenging. Olalekan, Jide and Oludare (2017) observed that the most evident cause of resistance to ICT's application in the service is obtainable among civil servants who do everything possible to oppose the change of processes or practices that have existed for years. It is this resistance to change that makes civil servants in Nigeria to be reluctant to share information thereby resulting in policies that deny access to information and the creation of empty government websites with information of little value.

Akunyili (2010) wrote that as a way of tackling the problem of resistance to change in the Nigerian public service, the government has continued to place emphasis on cultural change to ensure civil servants buy into the new technology driven processes, rather than manual ones that have been in place for many years. There is also the need according to her for consolidation of information and cross-sectoral collaboration in order to ensure that the entire civil service and other agencies of government share information and resources to ensure that policy design and implementation are driven by holistic perspectives.

e. Lack of Public Confidence and Trust in Online Interaction with Government

The last challenge of ICTs application in the Civil Service that we discussed here is the problem of lack of public confidence and trust in online interaction with the government. Many people in Nigeria do not have confidence and trust in e-government initiatives in the civil service. This has to do mainly with questions of data protection, network and information security. Indeed, the rate with which people abuse online information and communication scares both individuals and public administrators alike from depending on ICTs. The activities of cyber criminals and hackers have continued to be on the increase in Nigeria. The presence of JAMB, NECO, WAEC and similarly establishments online in Nigeria has led to the forging of documents since users now take results and documents online. The foregoing scenario compromises personal data, authentication of data and identity management. Government regulation could play an important role through specific legislation with respect to enhancing users' sense of privacy protection in online interaction.

Indeed, the difficulty that comes with securing public confidence and trust in online interaction with the government remains a threat to ICTs application in the civil service. Some civil servants in Nigeria even resist e-government initiatives in the service based on this factor. According to Nweke (2017), if ICTs application in public service delivery in Nigeria must receive boost, citizens and government should always be able to control access to their data, and how these data are stored, used, accessed and protected. To this end, the use of privacy enhancing technologies should be favoured to avoid breaching the law. These considerations are necessary to raise confidence and trust among Nigerians in embracing ICTs in public service delivery and accordingly reduce the resistance that comes with ICTs application in the civil service.

f. Infrastructural Deficit

ICT facilities in Nigeria are urban based. Most of the telecommunication base stations are located in the urban areas, with little or no access to the rural areas. Although the tele-density rate of the nation is high at almost 90 percent now. The rate and level of internet usage in the country is not encouraging and this adds to the challenges facing the implementation of e-governance in Nigeria (Nchuchuwe and Ojo, 2015).

2.4 Theoretical Framework

This study is anchored on the Technology Acceptance Model (TAM). The Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) was proposed by Fred Davies in 1989 and emphasises the acceptability of an information system and its impact in an organization.

The objective of this model is to predict the acceptability of a tool for use and to identify the modifications which must be brought to the system in order to make it acceptable to users. This model proposes that the acceptability of an information system is determined by two main factors: perceived usefulness and perceived ease of use (Ajibade, Ibietan, and Ayelabola, 2017). TAM posits that perceived usefulness and perceived ease of use determine an individual's intention which serves as a mediator of actual system use. Perceived usefulness is also seen as being directly impacted by ease of use (Ajibade, Ibietan, and Ayelabola, 2017). Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) introduced two new constructs; perceived usefulness and perceived ease of use. The first construct (perceived usefulness) believes that the usage of an application would increase performance while the other construct (perceived ease of use) believes that the use of application would make work stress-free (Shih, Shing & Chien, 2011).

Technology Acceptance Model is relevant to the Nigerian civil service as it explains the role played by self-efficacy, perceived cost, technological infrastructure, power supply, and internet facilities to support the adoption of E-governance and its impact on effective service delivery. Technology Acceptance Model is useful in explaining the acceptance, application, relevance and effectiveness of modern technologies in information sharing among citizens, public servants, government and galvanises public service delivery. The application of TAM to a study like this underscores user's technological behaviour and actual utilization. This is because, there appears to be factors inhibiting the overall adoption of E-governance and its consequent impact on effectiveness and efficiency in public service delivery to the people.

SECTION THREE

ISSUES, GAP AND OUTCOMES

3.1 Issues

Over the years however, it appears evident that public service delivery advancement has not kept pace with the quality found in the private sector despite the awareness that effective functioning of the bureaucracy is pivotal to poverty alleviation and economic growth and development (Nwachukwu, 2015). There have been several reforms aimed at addressing the crisis of inefficiency in the delivery of quality services in the public sector (Olaopa, 2008). Despite these reforms, there appears to be no significant and appreciable improvement in the State's public service. The civil service is still responsive in delivering quality service to the citizens of Enugu State. In spite of all efforts aimed at improving the administrative efficiency of the public service and repositioning it for effective service delivery, Enugu State civil service remains inefficient and incapable of delivering on its responsibility. Just as Oni, Oni and Gberevbie (2015) argued, efforts to attain higher productivity the public sector have remained a wishful thinking as bureaucratic inefficiency continues to constitute a serious concern. It has adversely affected the efficient delivery of public goods and services to the citizens (Darma and Ali, 2014)

3.2 Gap

The study observed that there is a gap in knowledge as to the effect of e-governance on service delivery in Enugu State Civil Service with focus on selected ministries. Studies reviewed have not ascertained the extent to which introduction of biometric verifications has improved payroll system and reduced ghost workers syndrome in Enugu State civil service. Similarly, it has not been determined the extent to which adoption of e-payment have enhanced efficient service delivery in Enugu State civil service. Studies have not been able to examine the extent to which the use of ICT facilities has influenced administrative processes in Enugu State civil service. This is the gap the study filled.

3.3 Outcome

In the course of this research, it was observed that introduction of biometric verifications has significantly improved payroll system in Enugu State civil service. Introduction of biometric verifications has reduced ghost worker syndrom in Enugu State civil service as it has enhanced Bio data capturing, processing and utilization. And Digitization of pay rolls in the public service has improved salary administration and integrated compensatory measures. Moreso, adoption of e-payment has enhanced efficient service delivery in Enugu State civil service. Adoption of e-payment has reduced incidents of embezzlement of public funds in the civil service. It helps in ensuring enhance efficient and effective collection of government revenue and accountability in public financial management in the civil service. And use of ICT facilities has influenced administrative processes in Enugu State civil service. Computers have enhanced the processing of documents. The use of ICT facilities helps in improving timeliness in performance of administrative tasks and responsibilities.

Electronic administration no doubt offers great opportunities for Nigeria and indeed all developing countries vis-a-vis public service delivery, and citizen's satisfaction. This accounts for the link between ICTs applications, optimization of government operations and achievement of important social development goals. This is why Gupta and Jana (2003) argued that the application of ICTs in government is no longer seen as an option but as a necessity for all countries aiming at having better and efficient administration. This shows that there is a strong linkage between ICTs application and efficient service delivery.

To be specific, ICTs have opened a new space or route that has huge potential for improving opportunities for the participation of citizens in governmental affairs. This type of

setting enhances equity, transparency, accountability, responsiveness, responsibility, effectiveness and efficiency in the manifold transactions that link service suppliers and service recipients (Muchie, 2011). The following are the effect of e-governance on service delivery in the civil service:

a. Reduced Cost of Administration

The application of ICTs in the Civil Service allows for a significant reduction in information handling cost. This process enables faster sharing of information thereby reducing the frequency with which data is collected when it is handled manually. Obviously, data collected manually costs more due to travel costs and other allowances and expenses. According to Ndou (2004) cited in Onuigbo and Eme (2015), if developing countries appropriately apply e-government initiatives, it will reduce the number of inefficiencies in processes by allowing file and data sharing across government departments, thereby contributing to the elimination of mistakes from manual procedures and reducing the required time for transactions. It is painful to observe that the cost of running governmental affairs in Nigeria has been on the rise hence the application of e-initiatives in the Civil Service has the capacity of providing cheaper administrative cost due to the digitalization of public service delivery.

b. Improved, Fast and Accurate Service Delivery

The traditional style of service delivery in the Civil Service is time consuming because of the bureaucratic nature of the Nigerian civil service. ICTs application therefore, helps to reduce waiting time and red-tapism, thereby bringing about fast and accurate service delivery. By this practice, ICTs application in public service delivery reforms public administrative process by streamlining internal processes which enables faster, speedy and more informed decision making and transaction process. Public sector organizations in Nigeria like the National Youth Service Corps (NYSC), Joint Admissions and Matriculation Board (JAMB) and a host of others have made service delivery to the citizens more convenient, faster and accurate through the digitalization of their operations and services. For example, Onuigbo and Eme (2015) stated that JAMB utilizes e-initiatives now to conduct national matriculation examination for admission into Nigerian higher institutions of learning. This yearly examinations that usually involve over one million candidates see scripts computer-marked, and the results released and up-loaded to the website within seven working days. All over the country, what it now takes for candidates to know their results is to visit the internet site of the examination body. The revolutionary dimensions of this ICT-enhanced service can only be appreciated when compared with the former system where the examination results were anxiously awaited by the candidates for close to eight weeks. When eventually released, the notifications were sent by surface mail service through the post office. This created all sorts of mix-ups as some notifications got lost in transit partly because some candidates' addresses would have changed in the interval. Very importantly, manually marked scripts were more prone to errors than computer marked ones.

One can therefore see from the JAMB example that ICT enhances improved, fast and accurate public service delivery. ICT eliminates time-wasting, loss of documents, delay in responding to requests, and kickbacks normally associated with traditional style of service delivery. Even the idea of repeated visits to offices from a far distance, which normally takes a toll on resources, is usually reduced through ICT usage. ICTs also allows for service delivery outside normal office hours. Arguing in this direction, Ndou (2014) averred that e-government initiatives put government services online thereby reducing bureaucratic bottlenecks, offers round the clock accessibility, fast and convenient transactions and obviously enhances the

quality of services. Similarly, intergovernmental and international communication relations with other public and private organisations are made faster and convenient. This can be seen on the dominance of e-mails, which have taken over surface mails. In addition, e-government initiatives such as electronic chatting, e-conferencing/video conferencing, etc, are making the public service smarter with reduced risks of travel. These initiatives also enable both the government and the private agencies to have discussions at a distance and at the same time run their respective offices.

c. Creates Access to Transparent, Accountable and Participatory Administration

E-government initiatives have already demonstrated significant capacity for citizens to have greater access to information from public authorities in Nigeria. Public service delivery improves citizens' participation in public sector management, which is enhanced through ICTs. The opportunity generated in this perspective helps increase the transparency of decisions as citizens and the public servants interact through E-governance process. The citizens and other service recipients are allowed to contribute and exchange ideas and suggestions through electronic forum and websites. ICTs reform which is presently being experienced through e-government initiatives in Nigeria's public administration has created opportunity for public servants and citizens to have access to official information and transaction which were previously classified. This invariably enables the Federal Civil Service to harvest more data from operational systems through increment in the quality of feedback. It is therefore, obvious that government to citizens type of relationships enabled by ICTs application, which before now created suspicion are now reduced as more information are made available through different kinds of on-line communication between the Federal Civil Service and her service recipients. ICTs usage in the Federal Civil Service therefore, enhances transparency, accountability and participatory Administration. It also reduces corrupt practices.

d. Enhances Networking and Inter Governmental Relations

ICTs provide and enhance networking of relationships among governments, customers, businesses, employees and other organisations. The successful use and diffusion of ICTs in the public sector involves a collective, multi-disciplinary and dynamic learning process (Onuigbo and Eme, 2015). This is the case of such Nigerian public agencies like NYSC, JAMB, AGIS, NOUN, WAEC, NECO, etc, that have fully embraced e-initiatives in the delivery of public services. According to Ndou (2014), the very nature and function of e-governments require network approach to put together skills, technologies, information and knowledge that span the boundaries of different governmental agencies. The application of e-government therefore, enhances the practice of Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP), which is an integrated business system that ties all the various functions of an enterprise like finance, human resource management, etc, into a cohesive system on a common database. In the view of Onuigbo and Eme (2015), ERP system may be integrated with the internet and workflow. ERP presents opportunities to the civil service in the areas of financial management, human resources management, records management, material management, etc. The establishment of integrated online network in the civil service therefore, enhances data sharing that facilitates feedback.

In addition to the foregoing, services like attachment mails, online delivery of scanned files, etc, speed up bureaucratic transactions in the Civil Service. The innovations that come with e- initiatives are reducing red-tap and similar lapses that come with traditional means of service delivery. Above all, e-government initiatives in the Civil Service enable civil servants to interact, transact and communicate electronically with business, citizens and other stakeholders. It is therefore necessary to mandate the use of ICT tools and applications for the development of new forms of citizens' participation in the Federal Civil Service.

e. Boosts Competitive and Responsive Service Delivery

The digitalization of operations and services in the public sector in Nigeria means that the public sector is in a healthy competition with the private sector in delivering qualitative and productive services to the citizens. ICTs application in the Civil Service therefore, boosts competitive and responsive service delivery in the country. This development is heart-warming and commendable especially when one recalls that the private sector was on top in the use of ICTs in the country prior to the digitalization of operations and services in the public sector. According to Nweke (2017) cited in Abasilim, Gberevbie & Ifaloye (2017), the Automated Custom Data, Electronic Immigration Passport/Visa Application, Nipost Post Cash, and other similar initiatives are examples of e-government potentials in reforming public administration for increased productivity and competitiveness.

In addition, ICTs usage in the civil service provides structure of opportunities mediating between the citizens and the service using digital information and communication technologies by the government and the citizens. It therefore, implies that ICTs application in the Federal Civil Service brings about citizens that are active, connected and informed. ICTs also help to stimulate exchange of information in which citizens and government relate interactively thereby enhancing productive and responsive service delivery. This also helps to bridge the gap between the citizens and the government.

In summary, the main purpose of E-governance is to improve the internal working processes of public service and cost cutting through proper application of sound electronic Administration in delivery of service to the entire citizenry. According to Arjan de Jager (2008), in Olalekan, Jide and Oludare (2017), the domain of E-governance are epicentred on building services with citizens choices, increasing government accessibility, fostering social inclusion, disseminating information in responsive and responsible styles and using taxpayers resources efficiently and effectively. It also ensures transparency in the workings of government policies, providing qualitative and cost effective services to the general public, provision of single window account for all government services, enrolling responsive administration and provision of speedier, efficient, and effective interface among businesses, citizens and governments. It provides free flow of information between departments, ministries and agencies within government, and ensuring standardized electronically-embeded decision making systems.

SECTION FOUR

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1 Conclusion

Electronic administration has become an indispensable feature of modern public administration and service delivery. The advent of information and communication technology has digitalized modern service delivery and as such, electronic administration enhances the performance of administrative tasks and responsibilities and encourages citizens' participation in governance. Hence, it is affirmed that introduction of biometric verifications has significantly improved payroll system in Enugu State civil service. Introduction of biometric verifications has reduced ghost worker syndrom in Enugu State civil service as it has enhanced Bio data capturing, processing and utilization. And Digitization of pay rolls in the public service has improved salary administration and integrated compensatory measures.

Adoption of e-payment has enhanced efficient service delivery in Enugu State civil service. Adoption of e-payment has reduced incidents of embezzlement of public funds in the civil service. It helps in ensuring enhance efficient and effective collection of government revenue and accountability in public financial management in the civil service. And use of ICT facilities has influenced administrative processes in Enugu State civil service. Computers have enhanced the processing of documents. The use of ICT facilities helps in improving timeliness in performance of administrative tasks and responsibilities.

4.2 Recommendations

In view of the findings of the study, the following recommendations were therefore made:

1. There is need for improvement in the use of biometric verifications for improved payroll system in Enugu State civil service.
2. There is need for government organizations to key into the e-payment system for enhanced service delivery in Enugu State civil service. This would significantly improve the collection of government revenue and promote accountability.
3. There is need for improved use of ICT facilities in administrative processes in Enugu State civil service. There is need for government to promote ICT facilities especially in the rural areas in order to promote citizens access to internet and participation in electronic administration. There is the urgent need for the government and those concerned to concisely tackle challenges computer illiteracy, epileptic power supply and high data costs so as to enhance the potentials of ICTs to deliver efficient and quality services to the service recipients of the Nigerian Civil Service.

REFERENCES

- Abasilim, U. D., & Edet, L. I. (2015). E-Governance and its Implementation Challenges in the Nigerian Public Service. *Acta Universitatis Danubius. Administratio*, 7(1), 30-42.
- Abasilim, U. D., Gberevbie, D. E., & Ifaloye, O. R. (2017). Attaining a better Public Service Delivery through E-Governance Adoption in Nigeria. In proceedings of the 4th Covenant University Conference on e-Governance in Nigeria (CUCEN 2017), 109-118
- Adiele G.N. (2017). *Governance and Public Service Delivery in Nigeria: The Role of Information and Communication technologies*. Being a conference paper presented at the Covenant University Conference on E-governance titled; Improving Productivity in the Public Sector through E-Governance Programmes.
- Akinleke, W.O. (2015). The contributory effects of socio-cultural factors on e-government adoption among Nigerians, *Global journal of politics and law research*, Vol.3 (1), pp.91104.
- Ananti, M.O. & Umeifekwem, U. (2012) Work Ethics and Productivity in Local Government System in Nigeria: Problems and Prospects, *African Research Review, An International Multidisciplinary Journal, Ethiopia*, Vol. 6(1), Serial No. 24, pp: 380-392
- Anazodo, R.O.; Okoye, J.C. & Chukwuemeka, E.E.O. (2012). Civil Service Reforms in Nigeria: The Journey so far in Service Delivery. *American Journal of Social and Management Sciences*, 3(1),17-29.
- Azeez, N. A., Abidoeye, A. P., Adesina, A. O., Agbele, K. K., Venter, I. M., & Oyewole, A. S. (2012). Threats to E-Government Implementation in the Civil Service as a case study. *The Pacific Journal of Science and Technology*, 13(1), 398-402.
- Azemi, H. S. C., Romle, A. R., and Udin, M. M. (2016) The implementation of ICT towards improving service quality in public sector. *World Applied Sciences Journal*, Vol. 34 (4), pp: 499-505.
- Barkan, J.D. & Gboyega, A. (2001). State and Local Governance in Nigeria. Draft of the World Bankn (Africa Region) of Public Sector and Capacity Building Program available at [http://info.worldbank.org/etools/docs/library/5783/State and Governance Nigeria.htm](http://info.worldbank.org/etools/docs/library/5783/State_and_Governance_Nigeria.htm). Date visited 30th January, 2019.
- Besley, T. & Ghatak, M. (2007). Reforming Public Service Delivery. *Journal of African Economies*, vol. 16, AERC Supplement 1, pp. 127 –156.
- Bolaji O.O. (2012). Nigerian Public Service Reforms and the Fourth Republic Experience: Challenges and Prospects. *Journal of Alternative Perspectives in the Social Sciences*, 5(1), 142-154.
- Brussell, J. (2011). Explaining cross-national variation in government adoption of new technologies. *International Studies Quarterly*, Vol. 55 (1), pp: 267-280.
- Budde, P. (2014). Country Reports Paul. *InterMEDIA*, 42(2), pp. 34 – 37.

- Choudrie, J., Umeoji, E. & Forson, C. (2012). *Diffusion of e-government in Nigeria: A qualitative study of culture and gender*. University of Hertfordshire Business School Working Paper. Retrieved from https://uhra.herts.ac.uk/dspace/handle/2299/5549_15/5/2017
- Darma, Nazifi Abdullahi & Ali, Muhammad (2014). An assessment of public sector service delivery in Nigeria: A case study of federal capital territory area councils, 2007-2011. *International Journal of Development and Sustainability*, vol. 3, no. 8, pp: 1756-1776.
- Dialoke I., Ukah F. O. & Ikoro E. I. (2016). Implications of training and manpower development on employee productivity in Alvan Ikoku Federal College of Education, Owerri. *International Journal of Economics and Business Management*, Vol. 2 (4), pp:30-39.
- Edosa, E. & Azelama, J. (1995). Institutions of Government. In Ikelegbe A. O. (eds) *Politics and Government: An Introductory and Comparative Perspective*. Benin City: Uri Publishing Ltd.
- Ehi, E. E. (2015) *A Critical Analysis of the Bank Verification Number Project Introduced by the Central Bank of Nigeria*, pp: retrieved from Esoimeme, Ehi Eric, A Critical Analysis of the Bank Verification Number Project Introduced by the Central Bank of Nigeria (January 3, 2015). Available at SSRN: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=2544934> or <http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2544934>
- Eme, O. I. & Chukwurah, D. C. (2015). An analysis of pros and cons treasury single account policy in Nigeria, *Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review (OMAN Chapter) Vol. 5, (4), pp:20-39*
- Estevez, E., & Janowski, T. (2013). Electronic Governance for Sustainable Development - Conceptual Framework and State of Research. *Government Information Quarterly*, 30(1), 94-109. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.giq.2012.11.001>
- Fang, Z. (2002) E-Government in Digital Era: Concept, Practice, and Development, *International Journal of the Computer, The Internet and Management*, Vol. 10(2), pp: 1-22
- Fatile, Jacob Olufemi (2012) Electronic Governance: Myth or Opportunity for Nigerian Public Administration? *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, Vol. 2, (9), pp: 122-140
- Gega, Elsa & Elmazi, Ilir (2012). E-Government and Public E-Services in Albania. Trends and Challenges. *International Journal of Management Cases*, vol. 14 (2), pp. 34-41.
- Hodos, Raul Felix (2014). Computerization of Public Administration to E-Government: Between Goal and Reality. *The Judicial Current*. Year XVII, no. 1 (56).
- Junaidu, B.M. and Aminu, M.M. (2015) Public Service in Nigeria- An Overview of Functions and Code of Conduct. *Global Journal of Politics and Law Research*, 3(1), 61-69.
- Kampen, Jarl; Walle, K.; Steven, Van De & Bouckaert, Greet (2006). Assessing the Relation between Satisfaction with Public Service Delivery and Trust in Government: The

- Impact of the Predisposition of Citizens toward Government on Evaluations of its Performance. *Public Performance & Management Review*. Vol. 29 (4), pp. 387-404.
- Kayode, A., Adagba, S.O. and Anyio, S.F. (2013). Corruption and service delivery: the case of Nigerian public service. *Wudpecker Journal of Public Administration*, 1(1), 001 – 006.
- Kemoni, Henry N. & Ngulube, Patrick (2008). Relationship between Records Management, Public Service Delivery and the Attainment of the United Nations Millennium Development Goals in Kenya. *Information Development*, vol. 24 (4), pp. 296 – 306.
- Kohlborn, Thomas (2014). Quality assessment of service bundles for governmental one-stop portals: A literature review. *Government Information Quarterly*. no(31), pp. 221 – 228.
- Martin, B. (1997). Social Public Services and their Modernization in the Context of European Integration, Dublin: European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions (EFILWC).
- Nam, Taewoo (2014). Determining the Type of e-government use. *Government Information Quarterly* (31), pp. 211-220.
- Nchuchuwe, F. E., & Ojo, A. D. (2015). Challenges and Prospects of Implementing e-Governance in Nigeria. *Covenant University Journal of Politics and International Affairs (CUJPIA)*, 3(2).
- Nkwe, N. (2012), E-Government: Challenges and Opportunities in Botswana. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 2(17), 39-48.
- Ntetha, Mduduzi Aubrey & Mostert, Bertha Jantine (2011). Availability and Utilization of Information and Communication Technologies for Service Delivery: South African Case Study. *South African Journal of Library and Information Science*, vol. 77, no. 2, pp. 125-177.
- Nwachukwu, L.C. (2015). Information and communication technologies (ICTS) and public service delivery in the Nigerian federal civil service: opportunities and challenges, *Journal of Social and Management Sciences* 5(2), 137-147.
- Obaro, O. A. (2005). Public Service and Development in Nigeria: Problems and Prospects. *BIU Journal of Social and Management Sciences*, vol.3, no.1, pp. 110-120.
- Oduwobi, T. (2011). From Conquest to Independence: The Nigerian Colonial Experience. *Historia Actual Online*, no. 25.
- Ogunrotifa, A.B. (2012). Federal Civil Service Reform in Nigeria: The Case of Democratic Centralism. *Radix International Journal of Research in Social Science*, volume 1, Issue 10, pp. 1-45.
- Okotoni, O. (2001). Problems and Prospects of Nigerian Bureaucracy. *Journal of Social Sciences*, vol. 7(3), pp. 1-24.
- Okotoni, Olu (2003). Personnel Deployment in the Nigerian Federal Civil Service. *Journal of Social Science*, vol. 7, no.1, pp. 21-27.

- Olalekan, A., Jide I., & Oludare A., (2017). E - Governance Implementation and Public Service Delivery in Nigeria: The Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) Application, *Journal of public administration and governance*, 7(4), 165-175.
- Olaopa, T. (2008). *Theory and Practice of Public Administration and Civil Service Reforms in Nigeria*, Ibadan: Spectrum Books Limited.
- Olatokun, W. M., & Adebayo, B. M. (2012). Assessing E-Government Implementation in Ekiti State, Nigeria. *Journal of Emerging Trends in Computing and Information Sciences*. 3(4), 497-505.
- Olowu, B. (1999). Redesigning African Civil Service Reforms. *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, vol. 37, pp. 1-23.
- Olson, Margrethe H. & Lucas, Henry C. (1982). The impact of office automation on the organization: some implications for research and practice. *Communications of the ACM*. vol. 25, Issue 11, pp. 838-847.
- Omeire, E., & Omeire, C., (2014). New Wine in Old Wine Skin: An Exploration of Major Constraints to E-Government Implementation in Nigeria. *European Scientific Journal*, 10(14), 481-487.
- Omotoso, Femi (2014). Public-Service Ethics and Accountability for Effective Service Delivery in Nigeria. *Africa TODAY*. vol.60, Issue 3, pp. 119 – 139.
- Oni, A.A., Ayo, C. K., Mbarika, V. W., Gberevbie, D. E. & Folarin, S. F. (2014). E-democracy Implementation: The Imperative of Agenda Setting The Proceeding of 14th European Conference on E-Government, Brasov Romania, June 13-14.
- Oni, Aderonke A. & Oni, Samuel (2014). E-parliament and Democratic Representation in African States: Prospects and Challenges. *International Journal of Computers and Technology*. vol. 13, no. 6. pp. 4566-4573.
- Oni, S., Gberevbie, D. and Oni, A. (2017) E-govemment and Administrative Efficiency in Nigeria's Public Service. In Akpan-Obong Patience, Ayo Charles and Adebisi, Ayodele (eds) *Issues and Concepts of E-governance in Nigeria — A Reader*. Published by Covenant University Press, Ota, Nigeria. page:145-156.
- Onuigbo, R.A. (2015). Electronic Governance & Administration In Nigeria: Prospects & Challenges, *Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review (OMAN Chapter)*, 5(3), 18-25.
- Onwuegbuzie, Anthony J.; Leech, Nancy L. & Collins, Kathleen M. T. (2012). Qualitative Analysis Techniques for the Review of the Literature, *The Qualitative Report*, vol. 17, Article 56, pp. 1-28.
- Osawe, C. O. (2015). Reengineering Professionalism in the Public Service towards Service Delivery" *Review of Public Administration and Management*, 4(7), 63 -75.
- Owens-Ibie, Nosa (2004). Communication and Development in Nigeria: A Discussion. *African Journal of Political Science*, vol. 9 (1), pp. 71-83.

- Oyedele, S.O. (2015). The Nigerian public service and service delivery under civil rule. *Journal of Public Administration, Finance and Law, Issue 7/2015* 33.
- Pathak, R. D.; Naz, R.; Singh, G. & Smith, R. F. (2010). ICT for Improved Public Service Delivery in Papua New Guinea Governance. *JOAAG*, vol. 5, no. 1, pp. 36- 44.
- Saxena, A. & Sharma, A.(2012). Challenges in Converting to ICT-Based Public Service Delivery System from Manual Service Delivery System in Bilaspur City, India. *Journal of e-governance*, vol. 35, pp. 91 – 95.
- Shah, A. (2005). Public Sector Governance and Accountability Series: Public Services Delivery. Washington DC: The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank.
- Sharma, G.& Sturges, P. (2008). Using ICT to Help the Poor Access Public services: an action research programme. *Information Development*, vol. 23(1), pp. 15-23.
- Shih, C. C., Shing, H. L., & Chien, Y. L. (2017). Recent Related Research in Technology Acceptance Model: A Literature Review. *Australian Journal of Business and Management Research*, 1(9), 124-127.
- Snellen, I. (2005). E-Government: A Challenge for Public Management in Ferlie, E. Lynn, L. E. and Pollitt, C. (eds). *The Oxford Handbook of Public Management*, pp. 399 - 420.
- Tan, C.W.; Benbasat, I. & Cenfetelli, RT. (2013). IT- Mediated Customer Service Content and Delivery in Electronic Governments: An Empirical Investigation of the Antecedents of Service Quality. *MIS Quarterly*, vol. 37 (1), pp. 77-109.
- Yusuf. O. (2006). *Solutions for e-Government Development in Nigeria. Accenture EIU Government Research. High performance delivered.*
- Zouridis, S. and Thaens, M. (2003). E-Government: Towards a Public Administration Approach. *Asian Journal of Public Administration*, vol. 25, no 2, pp. 159-183.