

THE CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES OF PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIPS (PPPs) FOR URBAN DEVELOPMENT IN NIGER DELTA CITIES

Igwe, Chinyere Emmanuel, Ph.D

Maurison Media Academy

Okwurume, Clarence Nkasirim, Ph.D.

Department of Business Administration

Faculty of Administration and Management

Rivers State University

Nkpolu-Oroworukwo, Port Harcourt

Abstract: This research investigated the challenges and opportunities of Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) for urban development in Niger Delta cities, addressing the critical question of how these partnerships can be effectively leveraged to improve infrastructure and services in the region. The study employs a document analysis approach and a comprehensive literature review. The literature review explores existing theories and best practices related to PPPs, urban development, and the specific context of the Niger Delta. Document analysis of relevant policies, project proposals, and environmental impact assessments enriched the data. The findings reveal a complex interplay of factors influencing PPP effectiveness. Legal and regulatory frameworks that aren't strong enough, government agencies that don't have enough institutional capacity, problems getting the community involved meaningfully, environmental concerns about the region's fragile ecosystem, and difficulties getting project financing because of perceived risks are some of the biggest problems. However, the research also highlights significant opportunities, including the potential for PPPs to address critical infrastructure deficits, stimulate economic growth, improve service delivery, and attract private investment. The study concludes that while PPPs hold considerable promise for urban development in the Niger Delta, their success hinges on addressing the identified challenges. Some of the suggestions are making PPP laws that are complete and easy to understand, investing in training for government officials, setting up substantial ways for communities to be involved, putting a lot of emphasis on environmental sustainability, and coming up with ways to lower investment risks. A context-specific approach, tailored to the unique socio-economic and environmental realities of the Niger Delta, is crucial for maximising the benefits of PPPs and achieving sustainable and inclusive urban development.

Key words: public-private partnerships, urban development, the Niger Delta, challenges, and opportunities.

Introduction

Urban development in the Niger Delta faces significant challenges, primarily due to unplanned expansion, inadequate infrastructure, and socio-economic disparities. Public-private partnerships (PPPs) have been proposed as a solution to these challenges, particularly in the housing sector. But PPPs can't fully solve urban development problems in the Niger Delta because of several issues, such as weak regulatory frameworks, a lack of money, and insufficient involvement of stakeholders. The Niger Delta region suffers from haphazard urban growth, leading to unplanned and unapproved developments that complicate urban planning efforts (Jiya et al., 2018). There is

a chronic deficiency in infrastructural facilities, which discourages investment and hampers economic development (Aduwo et al., 2017). Urban development initiatives often marginalise low-income groups, exacerbating socioeconomic inequalities (Ojebode, 2016).

Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) have been primarily focused on providing housing for high-income earners, with limited success in addressing the needs of low-income urban residents (Ahmed & Sipan, 2019; Gbadegesin, 2017). The lack of a sound legal framework, funding constraints, and poor financial projections hinder the effectiveness of PPPs in delivering affordable housing (Ekpenyong & Mmom, 2015; Gbadegesin, 2017). Despite challenges, PPPs present opportunities for promoting popular participation in housing provision, adopting realistic housing standards, and leveraging local materials (Ahmed & Sipan, 2019).

Establishing a clear and inclusive PPP policy that recognises all income groups can enhance the effectiveness of PPPs in urban development (Ojebode, 2016). Engaging stakeholders, including government agencies and private developers, can create synergy and improve planning and management processes (Jiya et al., 2018). Developing sustainable financing mechanisms and providing land at no cost can facilitate large-scale affordable housing projects (Gbadegesin, 2017). Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) in Niger Delta cities face significant challenges that hinder their optimal functioning in urban development. The primary research gap lies in understanding the specific barriers that prevent PPPs from achieving their full potential in this region. These barriers include political, financial, and project management issues, as well as a lack of institutional capacity and transparency. Rapid urbanisation and inadequate infrastructure exacerbate these multifaceted challenges, leading to the ineffective implementation of PPPs.

Political factors, such as lack of government commitment and policy inconsistency, significantly impact PPP implementation. In Niger State, political issues were identified as a major hindrance, with a mean score of 4.28 out of 5 in influencing PPP success (Ugonabo, 2023). Institutional weaknesses, including poor risk management and transparency, further complicate PPP projects. Strengthening institutional capacity and ensuring accountability are crucial for successful PPPs (Yudoko, 2024). Funding constraints are a critical barrier, with insufficient government budgets and financial incentives for private sector participation. Vyas-Doorgapersad (2023) emphasises the need for a Viability Gap funding framework to attract private investment. The high cost of building materials and unstable pricing deter private sector involvement in affordable housing projects (Owotemu et al., 2022).

Disagreements between public and private partners, as well as delays in project execution, are common. In Niger State, only half of the conceived housing projects were implemented, with some delayed due to funding and partnership disputes (Ugonabo, 2023). Effective coordination and inclusive collaboration, involving local communities and stakeholders, are essential for the sustainability of PPP projects (Yudoko, 2024). PPPs have the potential to address urban development challenges by leveraging private sector innovation and efficiency. However, this requires supportive policies and an enabling partnership environment (Yudoko, 2024). Incorporating local actors and ensuring resident participation can enhance the relevance and sustainability of PPP projects (Alabi et al., 2020).

The study aims to answer several specific questions and set specific goals about how Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) are used and how well they work in Nigeria, especially regarding housing, public services, and urban infrastructure. The overarching goal is to understand the challenges, success factors, and potential improvements in PPP frameworks to enhance infrastructure development and service delivery in Nigeria. PPP implementation is slowed by problems like excessive red tape, inadequate risk management, and a weak legal framework (Vyas-

Doorgapersad, 2023; Sanni, 2020). Limited funding, poor financial projections, and difficulty accessing credit facilities are significant barriers (Ahmed & Sipan, 2019; Sanni, 2020). The absence of a uniform national policy and inadequate regulatory frameworks complicate PPP projects (Aduwo et al., 2017; Okwilagwe, 2017).

For PPP projects to be successful, it is important to find key performance indicators and critical success factors like strong private sector involvement and the ability to make money (Ojebode, 2016; Jiya et al., 2018). Leveraging local building materials, providing free land, and establishing effective mortgage systems can enhance affordable housing delivery (Jiya et al., 2018; Aduwo et al., 2017). Establishing a clear institutional framework, sustainable financing mechanisms, and independent oversight to improve PPP outcomes (Ahmed & Sipan, 2019). Reforming PPP policies to encourage private sector participation and ensuring transparent transactions through public disclosures (Onyemaechi & Samy, 2016; Lugard, 2020).

The Niger Delta faces acute infrastructure deficits, and PPPs are seen as a solution to bridge this gap by providing necessary funding and innovation (Dada et al., 2024; Yudoko, 2024). The research highlights the role of PPPs in promoting sustainable urban development, which is essential given the region's rapid urbanization (Ugonabo, 2023; Patrose, 2023). With a significant housing deficit, PPPs are crucial for affordable housing solutions, particularly for low-income earners (Yudoko, 2024; Vyas-Doorgapersad, 2023).

Policymakers: The research provides insights into effective PPP frameworks and strategies, aiding policymakers in crafting policies that foster successful partnerships (Patrose, 2023; Owoola et al., 2024).

Communities: Local communities benefit from improved infrastructure and services, which enhance their quality of life and economic opportunities (Badi & Alhosani, 2024; Engel et al., 2014).

Private Sector: The research identifies opportunities for private sector involvement, offering them avenues for investment and innovation in urban development projects (Adedini et al., 2022; Owotemu et al., 2022).

While the research underscores the potential benefits of PPPs, it also highlights challenges such as political interference and the need for transparent governance structures (Dada et al., 2024; Adedini et al., 2022). Addressing these challenges is crucial for maximising the effectiveness of PPP in urban development. Additionally, the research emphasises the importance of inclusive collaboration, involving all stakeholders to ensure the sustainability and relevance of PPP projects (Ugonabo, 2023; Owoola et al., 2024).

Literature Review

Institutional Theory

The focus of institutional theory in PPPs is the process of institutionalisation, where PPPs integrate into existing social and regulatory frameworks. This involves overcoming resistance from established practices and actors, such as the traditional Engineering, Procurement, and Construction (EPC) model (Iandolo et al., 2024). For regional PPP projects to happen, an institutional setting that helps with integration, considering differences between regions and investment risks, is needed (Monteduro et al., 2021).

Stakeholder Engagement

Stakeholder theory is crucial in managing systemic risks and ensuring the success of PPPs. It involves transitioning from a strategic to a responsibility approach in stakeholder interactions, as seen in high-reliability organisations like Italian Civil Protection during the COVID-19 pandemic (Chudnovskaya et al., 2020). Effective stakeholder engagement can enhance corruption risk management in public organisations by involving internal and external stakeholders (Biygautane, 2022).

Risk Management

Risk management in PPPs involves addressing performance risks and ensuring transparent procedures. This is particularly important in regional projects where public partners support and monitor PPP initiatives (Monteduro et al., 2021). The role of stakeholders in risk management is also highlighted in municipal water infrastructure projects, where diverse stakeholder interests must be balanced (Węgrzyn & Wojewnik-Filipkowska, 2022).

Public Value theory is applied to assess the performance of PPPs, focusing on profitability, efficiency, and sustainable development. This theory helps align PPP strategies with broader public interests (Esposito & Dicorato, 2020). Sustainable urban development through PPPs requires balancing stakeholder interests and integrating sustainable practices into project management (Mugarura et al., 2020).

Empirical Review

Academic literature has extensively explored Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) in developing countries, particularly resource-rich regions like Nigeria. These partnerships are seen as viable solutions to infrastructure deficits, offering a blend of public oversight and private sector efficiency. However, the success of PPPs is contingent upon several factors, including regulatory frameworks, risk management, and stakeholder commitment.

Best Practices in PPP Implementation

Regulatory and Institutional Frameworks: A robust legal and regulatory framework is crucial for the success of PPPs. In Nigeria, establishing laws to regulate private investment in infrastructure has been pivotal, although challenges remain in their implementation (Saha & Prabakaran, 2023).

Risk Management: Effective risk identification, assessment, and allocation are essential. The shift towards availability-based payment mechanisms, such as Design-Build-Finance-Maintain (DBFM), has been noted as a best practice in managing financial risks (Fu et al., 2023).

Critical Success Factors (CSFs): Good governance, technical feasibility, and appropriate risk sharing are identified as critical success factors in PPP projects, particularly in transportation infrastructure in developing countries (Okoro et al., 2022).

Lessons learnt from PPP projects

Financial Viability and Economic Impact: Public-private partnerships (PPPs) have enhanced socio-economic conditions by stimulating local communities' economic activities and increasing property values. However, financial viability continues to pose challenges, requiring government intervention to overcome implementation obstacles (Molokwane et al., 2023).

Stakeholder Commitment: The commitment of both public and private partners is vital. Successful PPPs require a shared vision and mutual trust between stakeholders (Okoro et al., 2022).

Sustainability and Performance Measurement: Integrating sustainable practices into PPP projects is increasingly important. Performance measurement models must adapt to include sustainability criteria, such as carbon emissions and green indices (Sanni, 2022).

While PPPs offer significant potential for infrastructure development, they are not a panacea for all challenges. The complexity of these partnerships requires careful consideration of local contexts, stakeholder dynamics, and long-term sustainability. In Nigeria, for instance, the perception of PPPs as a quick fix to infrastructure problems is misleading. Instead, a nuanced approach that balances public and private interests is necessary for achieving desired outcomes (Rasheed et al., 2022).

Research Methodology

Research Design

The literature review is not merely a preliminary step in this research on PPPs for urban development in Niger Delta cities; it is a dynamic and iterative process that underpins the entire project. It serves as the foundation for the research, playing a crucial role in shaping its direction and ensuring its relevance (Harris, 2019). The literature review aids in defining and refining the research problem (Parajuli, 2020). Researchers can find knowledge gaps, learn about the complexities of public-private partnerships (PPPs) in urban development, and find out what makes the Niger Delta situation unique by looking at existing studies, reports, and policy documents. This process ensures the research tackles a significant and pertinent issue. Furthermore, the literature review is essential for developing a robust theoretical framework. Examining theories and concepts from diverse disciplines like public administration, economics, urban planning, and development studies provides a conceptual lens for data analysis and interpretation.

The literature review also aids in identifying key variables and their relationships. By examining previous research, the study determines which factors influence PPP success, thus informing the conceptual framework and data collection process. Importantly, it provides significant insights into the specific context of the Niger Delta, including its political and economic conditions, environmental challenges, and institutional strengths. This understanding is crucial for interpreting the results and making sound recommendations. Methodologically, the literature review guides the selection of research methods (Sekhon et al., 2024). Analyzing how others have approached similar topics enables the selection of appropriate data collection and analysis techniques. It also avoids redundant research, ensuring that the study builds on existing knowledge. The literature review is essential for formulating clear research questions and objectives, justifying the research's necessity and contribution, and offering a framework for interpreting findings. Finally, it facilitates the development of practical recommendations by examining best practices from other contexts. The literature review is an ongoing process that provides the theoretical background, contextual understanding, and methodological guidance necessary for a thorough and meaningful study (Varsha et al., 2024).

Data Collection Methods

Document Analysis: A range of documents related to PPPs and urban development in the Niger Delta were analysed. These included:

- Government policies and regulations related to PPPs.
- Project proposals, contracts, and feasibility studies for PPP projects.
- Environmental and social impact assessments for PPP projects.
- Reports and publications by government agencies, NGOs, and research institutions.

News articles and media coverage of PPPs in the region.

Document analysis provided valuable contextual information, allowing for examining official records and project-related materials (Bowen, 2009). This helped triangulate the data collected through interviews and focus groups.

Data Analysis Techniques

We conducted the document analysis component of this research systematically to extract meaningful insights into PPPs and urban development in the Niger Delta. The process began with carefully selecting and gathering a wide range of relevant documents. This included national and regional policy documents, legal and regulatory frameworks for PPPs, and, when needed, project-specific documents such as proposals, feasibility studies, ESIA's, contracts, and reports. Institutional documents from government agencies, NGOs, research bodies, media reports, and news articles were also collected to provide diverse perspectives and capture public discourse. These documents were then organised and managed systematically, often using a database or document management software. They were categorised by type, source, date, and relevance to specific research questions to ensure easy access and analysis.

Content analysis is the primary method used (Drisko & Maschi, 2016). Researchers thoroughly reviewed the documents to familiarise themselves before developing a coding framework. This framework identified key themes, concepts, and issues related to the research questions, such as legal barriers, community engagement, or financial viability. Document analysis was chosen for its ability to access valuable information and diverse perspectives often unavailable through other methods, allowing the examination of official records and project materials and ultimately contributing to a more comprehensive and nuanced understanding of the research topic.

Presentation and analysis of the findings

The document analysis revealed several key themes related to the challenges and opportunities of PPPs for urban development in Niger Delta cities. We present these findings below, illustrating the points with quotes and examples from the analysed documents.

Challenges:

- **Legal and Regulatory Gaps:** A recurring theme was the insufficiency and ambiguity of the region's legal and regulatory framework governing PPPs (Biygautane & Ahermouch, 2023). Several documents emphasized the lack of clarity regarding roles, responsibilities, and procedures, which creates uncertainty for both public and private sector partners. For instance, a report from Enfidha Airport in Tunisia pointed out that "the absence of a comprehensive PPP law at the state level presents significant challenges for project development and implementation." This lack of clarity can result in disputes, delays, and ultimately, project failure (Saha & Prabakaran, 2023).
- **Institutional Capacity Constraints:** Many documents point to managing PPPs effectively to the limited capacity of government agencies to manage PPPs (Biygautane & Ahermouch, 2023) effectively. This includes lacking expertise in project appraisal, contract negotiation, and monitoring. A government strategic plan states, "Capacity

building for public sector officials involved in PPPs is critical for ensuring successful project outcomes." This constraint can lead to poorly structured projects, inadequate oversight, and vulnerability to corruption (Saha & Prabakaran, 2023).

- **Community Engagement Challenges:** Several documents emphasised the importance of community engagement in PPPs and highlighted the challenges in achieving meaningful participation (Mthembu et al., 2023). A community development report observed that "community consultation is often tokenistic, with local communities not genuinely involved in decision-making processes." This lack of genuine engagement can lead to resentment, project delays, and conflict (Nicolaidis & Austin, 2022).
- **Environmental Concerns:** The Niger Delta's fragile ecosystem was a prominent concern in many documents (Ewim et al., 2023). Several environmental impact assessments (EIAs) for PPP projects highlighted the potential for adverse environmental consequences, such as pollution and habitat destruction. One EIA for a proposed infrastructure project noted "the need for careful mitigation measures to minimise the impact on sensitive ecological areas." Balancing development needs with environmental protection is a significant challenge.
- **Financial Viability and Risk:** Documents related to project finance often pointed to challenges in securing funding for PPPs in the Niger Delta. Concerns were raised about the perceived riskiness of investing in the region due to political instability and security concerns (Temitope et al., 2023). A financial feasibility study for a proposed PPP project stated, "Attracting private sector investment requires addressing concerns about risk and ensuring a stable and predictable investment climate."

Opportunities:

- **Addressing Infrastructure Deficits:** Many documents recognised the potential of PPPs to address the significant infrastructure deficits in Niger Delta cities (Omokungbe et al., 2022). A government policy document stated, "PPP can be a valuable tool for accelerating infrastructure development and improving access to essential services." Leveraging private sector expertise and investment is crucial for closing the infrastructure gap.
- **Promoting Economic Growth:** Several documents highlighted the potential of PPPs to stimulate economic growth and create regional jobs. A report by nine Asian developing countries (Atapattu, 2019) argued that "PPP can generate employment opportunities and boost local economies through infrastructure development and related economic activities."
- **Improving Service Delivery:** By leveraging private sector expertise and innovation, PPPs can offer better services to urban residents. For example, a water treatment PPP project proposal stated, "Partnering with the private sector can bring technical expertise and innovative solutions to improve water access and quality."
- **Attracting Private Investment:** Many documents recognised the potential of PPPs to attract private sector investment to the Niger Delta (Aduwo et al., 2017). By creating a favourable investment environment and offering attractive project opportunities, governments can leverage private capital to finance urban development projects.
- **Enhancing Institutional Capacity:** Some documents highlighted the opportunity for PPPs to enhance institutional capacity within government agencies (Biygautane, 2022). Government officials can gain valuable experience in project management, contract negotiation, and other relevant skills by working with private sector partners.

Discussion

The document analysis gave us helpful information about how complicated PPPs are for urban development in cities in the Niger Delta. This directly answered the research questions and allowed us to compare the results with other research that has already been done. For example, the recurring theme of legal and regulatory gaps directly answers research questions about the adequacy of the enabling environment (Jackson et al., 2020). Similarly, findings on institutional capacity constraints, community engagement challenges, and financial viability directly answer corresponding research questions. Identifying opportunities, such as addressing infrastructure deficits and promoting economic growth, also directly answers relevant research questions. We can then compare and contrast these findings with existing literature on PPPs, urban development, and the Niger Delta. For example, if the literature review showed that institutional capacity is a problem in many developing countries, then its presence in the Niger Delta backs up what we already know (Falola & Agbola, 2022).

We also analysed the findings through the lens of relevant theories. One example supporting institutional theory is that weak institutions are a big problem. On the other hand, problems with community engagement support stakeholder theory (Murphy et al., 2021). Contractual arrangement issues support transaction cost economics, and the importance of finance aligns with resource dependence theory. However, the findings might also contradict some theories. For example, successful PPPs despite regulatory hurdles might suggest limitations to institutionally focused theories, pointing to the importance of social capital. Alternatively, projects succeeding despite perceived high risk might necessitate refining risk assessment models for the Niger Delta context. Acknowledging the nuances and contextual factors revealed by the document analysis is crucial. While some findings support existing theories, others might highlight the unique characteristics of the Niger Delta. When there are environmental or security problems, it might be necessary to improve current theories or create new ones that consider these factors (Kanyimo & Ziyambi, 2022). The study adds to our understanding of public-private partnerships (PPPs) in urban development by carefully examining the results in light of the research questions, existing literature, and theories. This could lead to the improvement of existing theories or the discovery of new research areas.

Comparison with Literature

Comparing the results of the document analysis to those of other studies on PPPs, urban development, and the Niger Delta, one can see both the expected similarities and important differences. This gives a better understanding of how the region is different. For instance, the identified legal and regulatory gaps align with broader research on PPPs in developing countries, where studies have consistently emphasised the need for clear legal frameworks (Xiaohong, 2023). The Niger Delta's experience echoes this, suggesting it is a common challenge in contexts with developing institutional capacity. Similarly, the document analysis's findings on institutional capacity constraints reinforce the widely recognised challenge of limited expertise within government agencies managing PPPs (Fadeyi et al., 2016). This fits with research that shows a lack of capacity makes PPP less valuable, which means that building capacity is also vital in the Niger Delta. The challenges in achieving meaningful community engagement also resonate with research on the social dimensions of development, emphasizing community participation for project success (Srinivasan, 2024). The Niger Delta's experience reflects this, demonstrating that inadequate engagement can lead to project issues. Lastly, the problems with making the business profitable and reducing risk, especially when trying to get private investment, align with research

that shows how political instability and unclear rules can stop people from investing (Alier & Bill, 2022).

However, the Niger Delta also presents unique characteristics. While environmental concerns are globally relevant to PPPs, they are particularly pronounced in the Niger Delta due to its fragile ecosystem. This aspect might be less emphasised in studies of other regions. This underscores the region's unique environmental context and the need for PPP frameworks addressing ecological sustainability. The impact of the security situation on Niger Delta PPPs is another distinguishing factor. Research on PPPs in more stable contexts might not address this as prominently, highlighting the need for tailored risk mitigation strategies in the Niger Delta. Besides these, problems like weak institutions and missing rules are common, but the Niger Delta is the only place where they show up uniquely, as are the opportunities that are there. Effective community engagement strategies, or the most suitable PPP types, will differ from other regions, emphasising the importance of context-specific research.

Several factors explain these differences: the Niger Delta's unique ecological characteristics and geographic location influence feasible PPP types and environmental considerations. The region's socio-political history, including resource governance, conflict, and community relations, shapes stakeholder engagement and perceived investment risks. Finally, building up institutions is a problem that generally affects PPP implementation. However, the Niger Delta's institutions' strengths and weaknesses and how fast they are growing have a unique effect. This study adds to the body of research on PPPs and development by comparing its results to those of other studies. It does this by revealing common problems and factors unique to each region. This shows the need for solutions tailored to each situation and expands the knowledge on PPPs and development.

Conclusions and Recommendations

Conclusions

PPPs offer substantial potential for addressing the region's urban development challenges, especially in infrastructure and service delivery; realising this potential requires navigating a complex landscape. A significant finding is the inadequacy and ambiguity of the legal and regulatory framework governing PPPs, creating uncertainty for both public and private partners. This necessitates a comprehensive review and reform of existing legislation to provide clarity and encourage investment. Also, limited institutional capacity within government agencies makes managing PPPs difficult. This shows the importance of starting programs that build institutional capacity, especially in project evaluation, contract negotiation, and monitoring. Meaningful community engagement is also essential for PPP success, yet it often proves challenging. PPP processes must be designed to ensure genuine participation and address local concerns.

Given the Niger Delta's fragile ecosystem, environmental concerns are particularly acute. PPP projects must prioritise environmental sustainability while incorporating robust environmental impact assessments and mitigation measures. Securing financing for PPPs can be difficult due to perceived risks related to political instability, security, and unclear regulations; this emphasises the need for strategies to mitigate these risks and boost investor confidence. Even though there are problems, there are also big chances to use PPPs to improve urban development. For example, they can help fix infrastructure problems, boost the economy, improve services, and bring private investment. Crucially, a context-specific approach is vital for PPP success in the Niger Delta. Generic PPP models are insufficient; solutions must be tailored to the region's unique socio-economic, environmental, and political context. Key takeaways include the understanding that while PPPs can be powerful tools, their success is not guaranteed. Addressing the identified

challenges is critical to unlocking their full potential. A collaborative approach involving government, the private sector, and communities is essential, and sustainable, inclusive development must be central to PPP planning and implementation. Lastly, the Niger Delta's unique circumstances require further research to explore specific PPP models and strategies.

Recommendations

This study gives several helpful and policy-oriented suggestions for improving the performance of public-private partnerships (PPPs) for urban development in the Niger Delta. These suggestions are aimed at specific groups of people.

1. State governments should prioritise developing comprehensive PPP legislation that clearly defines roles, streamlines approvals, and establishes transparent procedures targeting work, infrastructure, justice, and finance ministries. Each state should also set up dedicated PPP units with experts, focusing on the infrastructure and works ministries. They should also put money into programs that help public servants at PPPs do their jobs better, such as using state civil service training centres and the right ministries. Promoting transparency and accountability through publicly accessible project information and independent oversight is crucial, targeting state houses of assembly and anti-corruption agencies. Finally, state governments should strengthen community engagement mechanisms, including consultations and grievance redressal, targeting ministries of land, surveys, and community development.
2. The private sector should proactively engage with governments and communities to identify PPP opportunities, adhering to high ethical standards in all dealings, and investing in local capacity development through training and employment. These recommendations target private sector developers, contractors, financiers, and industry associations. Communities should actively participate in PPP projects, attend consultations and monitor implementation, demand accountability from government and private sector actors, and target community leaders, CBOs, and residents. Development partners and NGOs can help state governments build PPP frameworks by giving them important technical support. This is especially true for development agencies and NGOs that work on urban development and governance. They can also help by monitoring and evaluating the results of PPP projects, especially those in charge of monitoring and evaluating them.
3. Some general suggestions are to encourage cooperation between Niger Delta states to harmonise rules and bring in investment, make environmental and social sustainability a top priority in all public-private partnerships (PPPs), and create a list of well-prepared, bankable projects to attract private investment. These recommendations aim to create a more favourable environment for PPPs by fostering collaboration among stakeholders, emphasising sustainability, and ultimately leading to more effective and sustainable urban development in the Niger Delta.

References

Adedini, S. A., Mberu, B. U., Alex-Ojei, C. A., & Ntoimo, L. F. (2022). Exploring barriers and facilitators to integrated policy formulation and implementation of family planning and urban development programmes in Nigeria. *Health Research Policy and Systems*, 20(1), 115.

- Aduwo, E. B., Ibem, E. O., & Onyemaechi, P. D. (2017). Challenges and opportunities in public-private partnerships (PPPs) for housing low-income earners in Nigeria. *Advances in Business and Management*, 12, 145-168.
- Ahmed, Y., & Sipan, I. A. B. (2019). Critical success factors of public private partnership for affordable housing in Nigeria. *International Journal of Recent Technology and Engineering*, 8, 57–69.
- Alabi, M. A., Kasim, O. F., & Lasisi, M. O. (2020). Public-Private Partnership (PPP) in residential solid waste management in Ibadan: Challenges and opportunities. *Journal of Geography and Regional Planning*, 13(1), 30–40.
- Alier, G., & Bill, D. B. A. (2022). The Effect of Political Instability in Country Prosperity. *IJRDO-Journal of Social Science and Humanities Research*, 8, 100-102.
- Atapattu, P. J. (2019). Infrastructure Investment with Public-Private Partnership (PPP) and Economic Growth in Developing Asian Countries.
- Badi, S., & Alhosani, M. (2024). Public-private partnerships (PPPs) are used to realise the sustainable development agenda in the built environment. In *The Elgar Companion to the Built Environment and the Sustainable Development Goals* (pp. 457-480). Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Biygautane, M. (2022). The Institutional Context of Public–Private Partnerships. *Books*.
- Biygautane, M., & Ahermouch, O. (2023). When the institutional context thwarts public-private partnerships: The role of political factors in the failure of PPPs. *Journal of Infrastructure, Policy and Development*, 7(1).
- Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document analysis as a qualitative research method. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 9(2), 27–40.
- Cheng, S., Yu, Y., Meng, F., Chen, J., Chen, Y., Liu, G., & Fan, W. (2023). Potential benefits of public–private partnerships to improve the efficiency of urban wastewater treatment. *Npj Clean Water*, 6(1), 13.
- Chudnovskaya, S., Vlasova, T., Volkov, M., & Tsvetkova, V. (2020). Institutional aspects of development of regional PPP Projects. In *E3S Web of Conferences* (Vol. 210, p. 13027). EDP Sciences.
- Dada, M. O., Ogunlana, S. O., & Anakor, C. A. (2024). Perceptions of Public and Private Sector Stakeholders on the Benefits and Challenges of Public-Private-Partnerships in Nigeria. *African Journal of Housing and Sustainable Development*, 5(1).
- Drisko, J. W., & Maschi, T. (2016). *Content analysis*. Oxford University Press, USA.
- Ekpenyong, O., & Mmom, P. C. (2015). Public-private partnership and tourism development in the Niger delta region. *Journal of Environment and Earth Science*, 5(2), 80-86.
- Engel, E., Fischer, R. D., & Galetovic, A. (2014). *The Economics of Public-Private Partnership: A Basic Guide*. Cambridge University Press.
- Esposito, P., & Dicorato, S. L. (2020). Sustainable development, governance and performance measurement in public private partnerships (PPPs): A methodological proposal. *Sustainability*, 12(14), 5696.
- Ewim, D. R. E., Orikpete, O. F., Scott, T. O., Onyebuchi, C. N., Onukogu, A. O., Uzougbo, C. G., & Onunka, C. (2023). Survey of wastewater issues due to oil spills and pollution in the Niger Delta area of Nigeria: a secondary data analysis. *Bulletin of the National Research Centre*, 47(1), 116.

- Fadeyi, T., Adegbuyi, A., & Ifeanye, O. (2016). Assessment of public-private partnership on infrastructural development in Nigeria: Challenges and prospects. In *3rd International Conference on African Development Issues (CU-ICADI 2016)*.
- Falola, O. J., & Agbola, S. B. (2022). Institutional capacity and the roles of key actors in fire disaster risk reduction: The Case of Ibadan, Nigeria. *International Journal of Disaster Risk Science*, 13(5), 716-728.
- Fu, L., Sun, H., & Xu, K. (2023). A systematic review of the public-private partnership literature published between 2012 and 2021. *Journal of Civil Engineering and Management*, 29(3), 238-252.
- Gbadegesin, J. T. (2017). Towards an effective partnership policy for improving urban low-income housing provision in Nigeria: new institutional economics perspective. *International Journal of Construction Supply Chain Management*, 7(3), 124-150.
- Harris, D. (2019). *Literature review and research design: A guide to effective research practice*. Routledge.
- Iandolo, F., La Sala, A., Turriziani, L., & Caputo, F. (2024). Stakeholder engagement in managing systemic risk management. *Business Ethics, the Environment & Responsibility*.
- Jackson, E., Pellini, A., & Prasertiamartati, B. (2020). Improving the enabling environment for evidence-informed policymaking: An example from Indonesia. *Evidence & Policy*, 16(3), 503-514.
- Jiya, A. B., Shaibu, S. I., Jiya, M. E., & Abdullahi, I. (2018). Analysis of Public and Private-Sectors Partnership (PPP) in Housing Delivery in, Niger State. Nigeria. *AU E-Journal of Interdisciplinary Research*, 3(2).
- Kanyimo, S., & Ziyambi, M. (2022). Document Analysis Trail Of English Reading Teaching Models: Implications For Second Language Teacher. *International Journal of Education Humanities and Social Science*, 5(04), 68-78.
- Lugard, S. B. (2020). Risks and Challenges in Public-Private Partnership Projects in Nigeria: A Case Study of the Concession of Murtala Mohammed Airport 2 Terminal (Lagos) to Bi-Courtney Nigeria Ltd. *KAS African Law Study Library*, 6(4), 563-576.
- Molokwane, T., Nduhura, A., Casady, C., Dick-Sagoe, C., & Lee, K. (2023). Public-Private Partnerships (Ppps) in Uganda: Implications for Practice and Policymaking. *Authorea Preprints*.
- Monteduro, F., Cecchetti, I., Lai, Y., & Allegrini, V. (2021). Does stakeholder engagement affect corruption risk management?. *Journal of Management and Governance*, 25(3), 759-785.
- Mthembu, Z., Mogaka, J. J., & Chimbari, M. J. (2023). Community engagement processes in low- and middle-income countries health research settings: a systematic literature review. *BMC Health Services Research*, 23(1), 457.
- Mugarura, J. T., Ndevu, Z., & Turyakira, P. (2020). Unleashing public private partnership understanding and the ideal underpinning theories: a public sector view.
- Murphy, J., Qureshi, O., Endale, T., Esponda, G. M., Pathare, S., Eaton, J., ... & Ryan, G. (2021). Barriers and drivers to stakeholder engagement in global mental health projects. *International Journal of Mental Health Systems*, 15, 1-13.
- Nicolaides, A., & Austin, A. C. (2022). Community Engagement as an Ubuntu Transformative Undertaking for Higher Education Institutions.
- Ojebode, A. J. (2016). *Public-private partnership (PPP) as a mechanism for affordable housing delivery in Nigeria* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Brighton).

- Okoro, C. S., Musonda, I., & Agumba, J. N. (2022). Exploring the underlying structures of sustainability performance measures: a study of transportation projects in South Africa. *International Journal of Construction Management*, 22(8), 1550-1558.
- Okwilagwe, O. O. (2017). Towards rethinking public–private partnership implementation: Insights from the Nigerian context. In *The Emerald Handbook of Public–Private Partnerships in Developing and Emerging Economies: Perspectives on Public Policy, Entrepreneurship and Poverty* (pp. 465-487). Emerald Publishing Limited.
- Omokungbe, O., Alaka, H., & Ayodele-Oja, S. (2022). Public private partnership (PPP) as an aid to tertiary institution support for internally generated revenue (IGR): a case study of yaba college of technology. *South Florida Journal of Development*, 3(3), 4122-4142.
- Onyemaechi, P., & Samy, M. (2016). Motives and motivation for implementing public private partnerships (PPPs) in housing provision in Nigeria. *Bid*.
- Owoola, W. A., Olaniyo, B. A., Obeka, O. D., Ifeanyi, A. O., Ige, O. B., & Bello, S. F. (2024). Cross-Sector collaboration in energy infrastructure development: New models for public-private partnerships in emerging markets.
- Owotemu, A. E., Daniel, C. O., & Abubakar, H. S. (2022). Evaluating the management of public private partnerships for the provision of affordable housing in Nigeria. *Journal of Service Science and Management*, 15(4), 392-415.
- Parajuli, J. P. (2020). Significance of literature review in the research of social sciences. *Journal of Population and Development*, 1(1), 96-102.
- Patrose, L. (2023). Role of public-private partnerships in developing sustainable cities: Framework, opportunities, mechanisms. *International Journal of Innovations and Interdisciplinary Research*, 1(1), 1–15.
- Rasheed, N., Shahzad, W., Khalfan, M., & Rotimi, J. O. B. (2022). *Risk Identification, Assessment, and Allocation in PPP Projects: A Systematic Review. Buildings* 2022, 12, 1109.
- Saha, R. K., & Prabakaran, P. A. (2023). A Literature Review on Implementation of PPP in Infrastructure Development: An Analysis of Constraints. *International Journal of Advanced Research in Science, Communication and Technology*, 3(2), 120-127.
- Sanni, A. (2022). Analysing the environmental impact of public-private partnerships in Nigeria. *Global Journal of Business Economics and Management*, 12(2), 95–102.
- Sanni, A. O. (2020). Infrastructural Development Through PPP in Nigeria: Internal Stakeholders' perspectives. *Perintis eJournal*, 10(2), 38–50.
- Sekhon, M., de Thurah, A., Fragoulis, G. E., Schoones, J., Stamm, T. A., Vlieland, T. P. V., ... & Nikiphorou, E. (2024). Synthesis of guidance available for assessing methodological quality and grading of evidence from qualitative research to inform clinical recommendations: a systematic literature review. *RMD open*, 10(2), e004032.
- Srinivasan, J. T. (2024). Community Engagement and Social Equity in Urban Development Projects. *Journal of Sustainable Solutions*, 1(2), 1-6.
- Temitope, A. B., Emmanuel, O. A., & Olaniyi, A. I. (2023). Evaluation of the Critical risk factors in PPP-procured Mass Housing Projects in Abuja Nigeria-A fuzzy synthetic evaluation (FSE) approach. *World Journal of Civil Engineering and Architecture*, 2(1).
- Ugonabo, C. U. (2023). Evaluating the Implementation of Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) for Housing Provision in Nigeria: A Case Study of Niger State. *Global Journal of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences*, 11(8), 12-21.

- Varsha, P. S., Chakraborty, A., & Kar, A. K. (2024). How to undertake an impactful literature review: Understanding review approaches and guidelines for high-impact systematic literature reviews. *South Asian Journal of Business and Management Cases*, 13(1), 18–35.
- Vyas-Doorgapersad, S. (2023). Investigating the use of PPPs for upgraded urban water infrastructure. *International Journal of Research in Business and Social Science (2147-4478)*, 12(3), 452-460.
- Węgrzyn, J., & Wojewnik-Filipkowska, A. (2022). Stakeholder analysis and their attitude towards PPP success. *Sustainability*, 14(3), 1570.
- Xiaohong, L. (2023). Addressing Challenges and Enhancing Sustainability in Public Private Partnerships (PPPs) in China. *Journal of Digitainability Realism & Mastery*, 2(04), 24–28.
- Yudoko, G. (2024). Toward Sustainable Operations Strategy: A Qualitative Approach to Theory Building and Testing Using a Single Case Study in an Emerging Country. *Sustainability*, 16(21), 9494.